UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re:)	Chapter 11
CELSIUS NETWORK LLC, et al.,)	Case No. 22-10964 (MG)
	Debtors.)	(Jointly Administered)

ORDER DENYING MARC BENZAKEN'S MOTION SEEKING A RULING THAT EARN ASSETS IN HIS ACCOUNT ARE NOT PROPERTY OF THE DEBTORS' ESTATES

Pending before the Court is the motion (the "Motion," ECF Doc. # 1510) of Mark
Benzaken¹ ("Benzaken"), a Celsius Earn Account Holder.² Benzaken seeks a ruling that
ownership of and title to the Earn Assets and Custody Assets in his accounts belong to him and
are not property of the bankruptcy estates of the debtors and debtors in possession of the abovecaptioned case ("Debtors" or "Celsius"). Benzaken asserts that he created his account on the
Debtors' platform no later than June 7, 2021. (Motion, at 4.) Accordingly, Benzaken would
have agreed to the fifth version of Celsius's terms of use ("Terms Version 5"), effective from
September 30, 2020 to July 21, 2021. (See "Terms Affidavit," ECF Doc. # 393, ¶ 6.) Benzaken
initially states that he did not agree to any other version of the terms of use except for the version
effective when he signed up for his account. (Id. ("I had never accepted any new [terms of use]
other than that which I was originally bound upon sign up").) He represents that he did not log

Michael Benzaken, filed a similar motion in this Court at ECF Doc. # 1512, as amended at ECF Doc. # 1814. To be clear, "Benzaken" as used in this Order refers to Marc Benzaken.

All capitalized terms not otherwise defined shall have the meanings ascribed to them in the Memorandum Opinion and Order Regarding Ownership of Earn Account Assets (the "Earn Opinion," ECF Doc. # 1822.)

in to the platform again until July 25, 2022, after the debtors filed for bankruptcy on July 15, 2022. (*Id.*)

However, Benzaken also states that his last transaction on the platform was December 10, 2021, during which the seventh version of Celsius's terms of use ("Terms Version 7") was in effect. (*See* Terms Affidavit, at 6 (stating that Terms Version 7 was effective from August 3, 2021 to April 13, 2022).) The Motion argues both that Benzaken should and should not be bound to Terms Version 7,³ and that he never accepted the eighth version of the Debtors' terms of use ("Terms Version 8"). (*Id.*)

Benzaken's primary argument is that he did not consent to a version of Celsius's terms of use which transferred title to Earn Assets in his Earn Account to the Debtors. (*Id.*) Additionally, Benzaken submits that because he only agreed to terms of use that did not provide the option of a Custody Account⁴, the Earn Assets in his Earn Account should have automatically become Custody Assets and his account transformed into a Custody Account when he failed to agree to Terms Version 8—the first version that provided the option of a Custody Account. He submits that his Earn Assets should therefore be treated as Custody Assets by this Court's decisions and any relevant rules under the Bankruptcy Code. (*Id.*)

On January 4, 2022, the Court entered the *Memorandum Opinion and Order Regarding Ownership of Earn Account Assets* (the "Earn Opinion," ECF Doc. # 1822). The Debtors filed an objection the Motion, arguing that the Court's Earn Opinion address Benzaken's arguments. (*See* "Debtors' Omnibus Objection," ECF Doc. # 1872, at 5.) For example, the Debtors note that

⁽Motion, at 4 ("Upon refusing to be accepted [Terms Version 8], effective April 14, 2022, and per my last transaction, 12.10.21 (Exhibit B), this means that there was nonacceptance of any [Terms Version 8] and as such I should be bound to [Terms Version 7] . . ."); but see id. at 5 ("I have provided overwhelming evidence that I did not accept . . . [Terms Version 7]").)

Celsius introduced its Custody Program, and therefore the option for certain customers to have a Custody Account, via Terms Version 8, effective April 15, 2022. (*See* Terms Affidavit, Exhibit A-8.)

22-10964-mg Doc 1935 Filed 01/25/23 Entered 01/25/23 08:15:30 Main Document

the Earn Opinion found that Celsius's Terms of Use unambiguously transferred right and title of

Earn Assets to Celsius beginning at least with Terms Version 5. (Id.) The Earn Opinion also

held that modification to the Terms of Use were valid contract modifications, and that the Court

would not consider extrinsic evidence relating to the interpretation of the Terms of Use. (*Id.*)

For the reasons discussed in the Earn Opinion, as an Earn Account holder, the assets in

Benzaken's accounts are property of Celsius's bankruptcy estates. Whether Benzaken is bound

by Terms Version 5 or Terms Version 7 is irrelevant, because the Court found that Terms

Version 5 stated, in relevant part, that Account Holders "grant Celsius . . . all right and title to

such Digital Assets, including ownership rights." (Terms Affidavit, Ex. A-5 § 14.) Account

Holders who agreed to Terms of Use Version 5 or later, whether by signing up for the first time

as Benzaken states he did, or by continuing to use the platform with an existing account, entered

a contract which contained unambiguous and clear language regarding transfer of title and

ownership of assets in Earn Accounts. (See Earn Opinion at 39.)

Accordingly, Benzaken's Motion is DENIED.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: January 25 2023

New York, New York

MARTIN GLENN

Martin Alenn

Chief United States Bankruptcy Judge

3